View Reviews

Paper ID

2669

Paper Title

Personal Primer Prototype 1: Invitation to Make Your Own Embooked Speech-Based Educational Artifact

Track Name

INTERSPEECH 2023 Show and Tell

Reviewer #1

Questions

- 1. Reviewer confidence (1-4) By selecting a value, you confirm that you are competent to evaluate this paper. If you have serious doubts about your ability to assess this paper, do not complete this form but instead use "Contact Meta-Reviewer".
- 4: Very Confident I consider myself an expert in this area
- 2. Appropriateness of topic for the conference. (1-4) If you give a score of 1 or 2, please provide further explanation in your Detailed Comments.
- 4: Very appropriate matches theme
- 3. Innovation and novelty associated with the system/demo/presentation (1-4) If you give a score of 1 or
- 2, please provide further explanation in your Detailed Comments.
- 4: Very novel and/or innovative
- 4. Clarity of presentation (both paper and video) (1-4) Please evaluate the clarity of the presentation of the work. If you give a score of 1 or 2 please provide further explanation in your Detailed Comments.
- 3: Clear enough, could benefit from some revision
- 5. Overall recommendation (1-6)
- 6: Definite Accept: I feel strongly that this paper and demo must be accepted
- 6. Detailed Comments for Authors Please supply detailed comments to back up your rankings. These comments will be forwarded to the authors of the paper. The comments will help the Show and Tell organisers decide the outcome of the paper and demo, and will help justify this decision for the authors. If the paper is accepted, the comments should guide the authors in making revisions for a final manuscript and demo. Hence, the more detailed you make your comments, the more useful your review will be both for the committee and for the authors. (min. 120 words). Particularly, provide feedback on the following topics: * Overall Impression * Novelty/Originality and Innovation, taking into account the relevance of the work for the Interspeech audience * Clarity of presentation (paper and video). The English does not need to be flawless, but the text should be understandable * Any areas you would like to see emphasised, clarified and/or enhanced in the final paper and demo.

This paper and video present a physical prototype of a "personal primer" device, designed for educational purposes.

This a novel and interesting application of speech-based technology, and will make for a very engaging demonstration at the conference. The philosophy behind the design and functionality are well explained in the paper and video. While the video introduces the device clearly, the opening sections of the paper are difficult to understand without larger context. The authors should explain briefly what a "personal primer" actually is before listing all of the desired properties and possible users.

other comments:

- the video would benefit from a demonstration of the speech-based capability of the device (speech recognition / speaker verification)

- can the authors comment on any speech recognition / speaker verification adaptations required for child speech?
- the authors should proof-read their article; there are some typos (e.g. "speech&tell", "s should", "The sampe applies") and issues with the reference formatting
- 7. Addressing the conference theme The theme of INTERSPEECH 2023 is Inclusive Spoken Language Science and Technology Breaking Down Barriers. Whilst it is not a requirement to address this theme, we encourage submissions that: report performance metric distributions in addition to averages; break down results by demographic; employ diverse data; evaluate with diverse target users; report barriers that could prevent other researchers adopting a technique, or users from benefitting. This is not an exhaustive list, and authors are encouraged to discuss the implications of the conference theme for their own work. To what degree does this paper address the conference theme?
- 4: Outstanding